Carbon Fluxes during Dansgaard-Oeschger Events as Simulated by an Earth System Model

Jochum, Markus; Chase, Zanna; Nuterman, Roman; Pedro, Joel; Rasmussen, Sune; Vettoretti, Guido; Zheng, Peisong

Published in:
Journal of Climate

DOI:
10.1175/JCLI-D-21-0713.1

Publication date:
2022

Document version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Document license:
CC BY

Citation for published version (APA):
Carbon Fluxes during Dansgaard–Oeschger Events as Simulated by an Earth System Model

MARKUS JOCHUM,a ZANNA CHASE,b ROMAN NUTERMAN,a JOEL PEDRO,b SUNE RASMUSSEN,a GUIDO VETTORETTI,a AND PEISONG ZHENGc

a Niels Bohr Institute, Copenhagen, Denmark  
b University of Tasmania, Hobart, Australia  
c Shantou University, Shantou, China

(Manuscript received 15 September 2021, in final form 29 April 2022)

ABSTRACT: The Community Earth System Model with marine and terrestrial biogeochemistry is configured to simulate glacial climate. The integration shows transitions from warm to cold states—interstadials to stadials—and back. The amplitude of the associated Greenland and Antarctica temperature changes and the atmospheric CO2 signal are consistent with ice-core reconstructions, and so are the time lags between termination of a stadial, Antarctic temperature reversal, and the decline of the atmospheric CO2 concentration (for brevity’s sake simply referred to as CO2 from here on). The present model results stand out because the transitions occur spontaneously (without forcing changes like hosing) and because they reproduce the observed features above in a configuration that uses the same parameterizations as climate simulations for the present day (i.e., no retuning has been done). During stadials, precipitation shifts lead to reduced growth on land, which dominates the CO2 increase; the ocean acts as a minor carbon sink during the stadials. After the end of the stadials, however, the sudden reversal of the stadial anomalies in temperature, wind, and precipitation turns the ocean into a carbon source, which accounts for the continued rise of CO2 for several hundred years into the interstadial. The simulations also provide a novel possible interpretation for the observed correlation between CO2 and Antarctic temperature: rather than both being controlled by Southern Ocean processes, they are both controlled by the North Atlantic Ocean, and most of the extra CO2 may not be of Southern Hemisphere origin. If the stadials are prolonged through North Atlantic hosing, the upper ocean comes to an equilibrium, and the CO2 response is dominated by a single process: reduced export production in the North Atlantic as result of the collapsed overturning circulation. This is in contrast to the unforced simulation where the net ocean carbon flux anomaly is the sum of several regional responses of both signs and similar magnitudes. Reducing the aeolian iron deposition by half, to account for the observed reduction of Southern Hemisphere dust fluxes during stadials, reduces biological productivity and export production so that the Southern Ocean emerges as an important carbon source, at least for the three centuries up until a new equilibrium for the upper ocean is reached.

SIGNIFICANCE STATEMENT: The last ice age featured millennial-scale oscillations in CO2 and temperature, the latter being anticorrelated between Greenland and Antarctica. This is often referred to as the bipolar seesaw. Here, an Earth system model is described that reproduces these signals, and its results are used to explain the observed correlation between temperature and CO2. In contrast to previous idealized studies it is found that all ocean basins and the land each contribute equally to the CO2 signal.

KEYWORDS: Ocean; Ice age; Climate variability

1. Introduction

During the last glacial, Greenland temperatures exhibited abrupt changes between warm interstadial and cold stadial conditions. We will refer to the sudden warmings as Dansgaard–Oeschger (D-O) events (Dansgaard et al. 1993). Numerical experiments suggest that they are initiated by sudden sea ice loss in the Nordic, Irminger, and Labrador Seas (Li et al. 2010; Pelletier and Vettoretti 2014; Kleppin et al. 2015), which may be preceded by slow changes to ice sheets or CO2 [Zhang et al. (2014) and Zhang et al. (2017), respectively]. There is observational evidence that they are associated with large changes of the Atlantic meridional overturning circulation (AMOC; Henry et al. 2016) and global monsoon systems (e.g., Corrick et al. 2020). During stadials, Antarctica warms, and then cools again during the interstadials (Buizert et al. 2015a; Fig. 1), as does the South Atlantic (Barker et al. 2009; Anderson et al. 2021). The peaks in Antarctic warming, termed Antarctic Isotope Maximum (AIM) events, are accompanied by anomalies in CO2 that range between several ppm for centennial-scale events to up to 20 ppm for millennial-scale events (Bauska et al. 2021). It is the goal of the present study to quantify in an Earth system model (ESM) the various processes that contribute to this stadial rise in CO2.

The close relationship between anomalies in Antarctic temperature and CO2 (Fig. 1) suggests a Southern Ocean control of the CO2 increase (Ahn and Brook 2008), which is qualitatively supported by several chemical and biological proxies in Southern Ocean sediment records (R. F. Anderson et al. 2009; Gottschalk et al. 2016; Jaccard et al. 2016; Rae et al. 2018). Moreover, the model study of Meniel et al. (2015) suggests the stadial increase in Antarctic Bottom Water formation as a mechanism for increasing CO2.
Another potentially important basin to contribute to the CO₂ fluctuations is the North Atlantic. Motivated by the weak stadial AMOC, several numerical studies have analyzed the response of the carbon cycle to AMOC collapse induced by freshwater forcing in the North Atlantic. They find an increase in CO₂ associated with an AMOC collapse. This is explained by a reduction in the efficiency of the biological pump, because the production of North Atlantic Deep Water (NADW), which is low in preformed nutrients, is decreased (e.g., Schmittner and Galbraith 2008). Land carbon, too, may contribute to the stadial CO₂ signal (Bauska et al. 2018), and terrestrial models find in response to stadial changes in temperature and precipitation a loss of terrestrial carbon in either the boreal regions (Scholze et al. 2003) or the tropics (Bozbiyik et al. 2011; Nielsen et al. 2019). All the studies above employ simplified model setups, either by decoupling the carbon cycle from the climate models or by using models of intermediate complexity. A thorough review of 55 of these simplified-model studies is provided by Gottschalk et al. (2019). They find that carbon flux responses to various forcing changes (e.g., air–sea flux changes in response to increased freshwater forcing) vary substantially from model to model; moreover, the net CO₂ responses are the results of several positive and negative feedbacks (e.g., loss of land carbon is compensated by increased oceanic uptake). Unfortunately, most of these results are plausible and we are faced with a conundrum: if our models cannot credibly reproduce the past, have we understood and accounted for the important processes?

The present study is an attempt to approach the issue from a different angle: rather than building a simple model with what we think we know, we use a full ESM, whose model–data mismatches can point us to things we do not know. Surprisingly, the Community Earth System Model (CESM1) can reproduce several important features of D-O events without changing its physical or biogeochemical parameterizations (with the exception of two; see next section) from their preindustrial configurations. However, large assumptions have to be made about the sizes of the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM) carbon pools, which are detailed in the next section. Section 3 describes the results of the numerical experiments, section 4 puts them into the context of observations and other model studies, and a summary in section 5 concludes our study.

2. Experimental design

We use the coarse-resolution version of CESM1 (Hurrell et al. 2013; Shields et al. 2012). It consists of models of the ocean, the atmosphere, sea ice, and land; they are connected through a coupler, which passes and interpolates fluxes between the various models. The ocean resolution varies smoothly with location, with resolutions of approximately 20 km around Greenland, 100 km in the Southern Ocean, and 400 km in the subtropical North Pacific. There are 60 vertical layers with nonuniform thickness, ranging from 10 m at the surface to 250 m at the bottom. The ocean model is run with the Gent and McWilliams (1990)
representation for mesoscale mixing and uses a stratification-dependent thickness and isopycnal diffusivity (Ferreira et al. 2005). The atmospheric model uses a T31 spectral truncation in the horizontal (3.75° resolution) with 26 vertical layers. In all the present simulations, changing CO₂ will change radiative forcing. Biogeochemistry is coupled to the climate system and actively exchanges carbon between ocean, atmosphere, and land. The ocean component includes diatoms, small phytoplankton, and diazotrophs, with phytoplankton growth controlled by temperature, light, and available nutrients (nitrate, phosphate, silicate, and iron; Moore et al. 2013; Lindsay et al. 2014). CESM1 has a fixed lysocline (i.e., the depth at which calcium carbonate remineralizes is fixed). Thus, the present setup does not allow for carbonate compensation, a feedback between ocean acidity and calcium carbonate sedimentation that is speculated to affect CO₂ on time scales of millennia or longer (e.g., Archer et al. 2000; Brovkin et al. 2007). The land component prognostically computes leaf and stem area indices and vegetation height using a prescribed spatial distribution of plant functional types (Lawrence et al. 2011).

The present-day coarse-resolution climate of CESM1 is in many aspects similar (i.e., it has the same biases) to its 10 times more expensive 1° resolution version (Shields et al. 2012); using 160 cores yields a simulation rate of 90 per day. In its present LGM configuration the stadials are not forced by freshwater hosing, but emerge spontaneously just as in its high-resolution version, and Vettoretti and Peltier (2018) describe in detail the physical aspects of the D-O events. Pedro et al. (2018) use a coarse-resolution LGM configuration of CCSM3, a predecessor of CESM1, the main difference of which is an improved representation of tropical convection (Neale et al. 2008). They show with hosing experiments how a collapse of the AMOC leads to Antarctic warming. The patterns, magnitude, and timing of the global response of the physical system in the present study is similar to the ones in Pedro et al. (2018) and Vettoretti and Peltier (2018) (not shown), so that here the focus is on biogeochemistry and CO₂.

b. Initialization

The ocean volume resulting from the resulting 120-m sea level drop is 5.7% lower, and the concentrations of all the passive tracers [nutrients and plankton classes (see above) as well as dissolved inorganic and organic carbon (DIC and DOC, respectively)] are increased correspondingly to have the same total inventory. Salinity is increased by only 3%, 1 psu, to be in line with previous studies (e.g., Brady et al. 2013). Land cover types are the same between GLA and PRE, and wherever new land emerges as part of the sea level drop, it is covered by the type of its nearest neighbor. The initial distribution patterns (not magnitudes; see above) of all ocean tracers, including temperature and salinity, are identical in the two configurations and based on a 2000-yr-long preindustrial integration of the 1° version of CESM1 (Lindsay et al. 2014). In the land model the plant functional types are fixed; a forest grid cell will always contain only forest. This forest, however, can contain a smaller or larger leaf area depending on the growth conditions for forest (e.g., light, moisture, temperature), thereby affecting carbon content, albedo, and air–land fluxes. The initial carbon content of the land model in PRE is the result of a spinup with a preindustrial atmosphere reanalysis (Lawrence et al. 2011), whereas in GLA the initial carbon content of the land model is zero, so that it can find its own equilibrium carbon content.

c. Spinup procedure

GLA is integrated for 7000 years, in the first 3000 of which the ocean mean temperature drops from its initial preindustrial value of 3.6°–0.8°C, in agreement with the reconstructed difference from ice core noble gas records of 2.6° ± 0.2°C (Bereiter et al. 2018). The following 4000 years the temperature drift is 0.1°C, much smaller than the stadial to interstadial decrease of 0.4°C (not shown). Similarly, the final 4000 years have CO₂ drift of 1 ppm, whereas the peak-to-trough amplitude is 5 ppm and the mean concentration is 217 ppm. Thus, after year 3000 we consider the model spun up for the present purposes. PRE is integrated for 5000 years, and as for GLA we consider the model spun up after 3000 years. The only purpose of including PRE here is to understand the differences in the model carbon pools between the LGM and preindustrial times.

d. Carbon pools

A meaningful numerical experiment requires the numerical representation of the laws of nature, boundary conditions, forcing, and initial conditions. We are confident about our choices of the first three: CESM1 is a well-tested ESM and much is known about orbital forcing, orography, and bathymetry during the LGM. However, only little is known about the carbon pools. In fact, it is one of the central challenges in climate research to explain the deglacial 50% increase in CO₂ (e.g., Sigman et al. 2010). Thus, one would have to solve that problem before one could properly initialize GLA. For most tracers we chose the simple assumption of mass conservation (see above). For carbon we cannot do this, because we know that LGM CO₂ is much lower than during the preindustrial, so the various carbon pools must have been different between the preindustrial and the LGM. The only way to control CO₂...
without changing the model configuration is to control the total amount of carbon in the system. We find that using 1480 PgC (1 PgC is 1 petagram or $10^{12}$ kg of carbon) less carbon in GLA than in PRE leads to a climate that resembles the LGM (see section 3). This number has not been the result of numerous trials and errors; it just happens to be the initial carbon content of the terrestrial biosphere in PRE. Thus, initializing GLA with zero terrestrial carbon serendipitously leads to a climate that resembles the LGM. This, together with the initial carbon content for ocean and atmosphere (the same for PRE and GLA), leads to the implicit assumption that during the glacial the inert carbon pools (ocean sediments, permafrost, or peat, none of which are part of CESM) contain 1480 PgC more than during 1850 CE (i.e., the total active carbon content in GLA is 1480 PgC lower than in PRE; see Table 1).

The size of the atmospheric carbon pool, of course, is well constrained, but no observational estimates exist for the LGM ocean [but see Galbraith and Skinner (2020) for a recent review of the vast literature]. The active land contains 580 PgC more in PRE than in GLA, which is consistent with the upper bound of the observed $330 \pm 400$ PgC (Ciais et al. 2012). The postulated size of the inert carbon pool, too, is consistent with observations, but barely: estimates of organic carbon burial in ocean sediment and inert-land carbon pools suggest that compared to present day, the glacial pools contained 200–500 PgC (Cartapanis et al. 2016) and 400–1000 PgC (Ciais et al. 2012) more carbon, respectively.

Last, the impact of the implied ocean sediment pools (i.e., carbonate burial) on marine biogeochemistry needs to be considered. Because CESM1 has a fixed lysocline depth, carbonate burial does not vary in response to changes in ocean chemistry. Here we attempt to constrain this effect. It is important to recognize that although the ocean in GLA contains less carbon than in PRE, the concentrations of dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC; the sum of the carbonate species) and alkalinity in GLA are greater than in PRE. This is because the decrease in the size of the ocean carbon pool during LGM is not large enough to counter the concentrating effect of decreased ocean volume. The increases in DIC and alkalinity produce a higher carbonate ion concentration in GLA than in PRE. According to the carbonate compensation concept (e.g., Archer et al. 2000), assuming a constant input of alkalinity from rivers, this increase in carbonate ion concentration would lead to increased burial of calcium carbonate, and associated removal of alkalinity and DIC in a 2:1 ratio until the original PRE carbonate ion concentration is reached. Following Tyrrell et al. (2007), we estimate that this results in a CO$_2$ approximately 30 ppm larger than in GLA. Thus, the carbon pools in GLA are inconsistent with observations, despite their large uncertainties [see Jeltsch-Thommes et al. (2019) for their careful quantification], and the GLA ocean contains less carbon than it should. For the remainder of this study it is therefore assumed that the presented results are not dependent on the total carbon content of the ocean. This point will be taken up again later in the discussion.

e. Hosing and iron

It will become clear in the following section that the unforced stadials in GLA are of realistic but short duration. Furthermore, they exhibit only minor changes in Southern Ocean carbon fluxes despite observational evidence to the contrary (see the introduction). Thus, in addition to the main simulation GLA, two more simulations are performed to investigate the importance of 1) stadial duration and 2) dust deposition. The latter is motivated by the hypothesis that in the Southern Hemisphere the warming associated with stadials leads to a moister and less dusty atmosphere, which can affect marine productivity in iron limited regions, and hence CO$_2$ (Martin 1990; Martínez-García et al. 2014). The extra simulation areas are as follows:

1) HOSE is branched off in the middle of the first GLA stadial (yr 4200) and submitted to an 800-yr, 0.05-Sv (1 Sv $\equiv 10^6$ m$^3$ s$^{-1}$) pulse of freshwater spread over the North Atlantic between 50$^\circ$ and 70$^\circ$N. This pulse corresponds to an equivalent sea level rise of 1.8 m and mimics a Heinrich (1988) event.

2) IRON is identical to HOSE, but the aeolian flux of dust, which is identical in PRE, GLA, and HOSE, is everywhere reduced by 50%. Note that, unlike PRE, GLA, and HOSE, this is not an attempt to quantify the global importance of a particular process. For that there are still too many uncertainties surrounding the impact of iron on marine biogeochemistry (e.g., Tagliabue et al. 2017) and the magnitude and spatial distribution of its sources (e.g., Muglia et al. 2017). Instead, IRON is a mere sensitivity experiment. It is designed to elaborate how the observed strong stadial biogeochemical signal in the SO that is absent in GLA (see section 3) can be accounted for.

3. Results

There are three parts to this section: a basic description of model behavior, an integration of carbon fluxes by region, and a repeat of the latter for HOSE and IRON.

a. Basic description of GLA

The first stadial begins at year 3920, the first interstadial at year 4380 (the black lines in Fig. 2a, defined as the times when the Greenland temperature anomaly becomes negative or positive, respectively), the Antarctic warming ends at approximately year 4460, and CO$_2$ starts to decrease approximately 200 years after that. The 80-yr time lag between the onset of the interstadial and the Antarctic temperature maximum is close to the 100 years recently inferred from matching volcanic signatures in ice cores from Antarctica and Greenland (Svensson et al. 2020), but less than half of earlier methane-based estimates (Buizert et al. 2015b). The simulated stadial-to-interstadial (minimum to maximum) differences in Greenland and Antarctic temperature and

---

### Table 1. Carbon pool sizes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Carbon pools</th>
<th>Ocean</th>
<th>Atmosphere</th>
<th>Active land</th>
<th>Inert pool</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LGM</td>
<td>35640</td>
<td>460</td>
<td>740</td>
<td>1480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRE</td>
<td>36430</td>
<td>570</td>
<td>1320</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---
atmospheric CO₂ are 15°C, 15°C, and 4 ppm, respectively. This corresponds to a 0.3°C century⁻¹ Antarctic temperature rise and a 0.9 ppm century⁻¹ CO₂ rise, both being slightly above the observational range of 0.6 ± 0.25 ppm century⁻¹ and 0.12° ± 0.04°C century⁻¹ [Zheng et al. (2021) and EPICA Community Members (2006), respectively].

As described in detail by Vettoretti and Peltier (2018), the stadial build-up of subsurface heat in the North Atlantic gives rise to a sudden emergence of polynyas in the Irminger Basin. The resulting destruction of the vertical salinity gradient restarts the AMOC (Fig. 2b), warms the northern polar latitudes (Fig. 2c), and shifts precipitation patterns across the planet (Fig. 3a). The subtropical build-up of salinity during the stadials leads to positive density anomalies resulting in an overshoot of AMOC strength (Fig. 2b). Such an overshoot following an AMOC recovery has already been proposed by Barker et al. (2010) based on radiocarbon observations and carbonate preservation indicators in the South Atlantic. Of interest here is

Fig. 2. (a) Greenland (50°–30°W, 65°–75°N; black) and Antarctic (multiplied by 5; blue) temperature anomalies, and CO₂ (red) anomalies (all results here are for GLA). (b) Subthermocline AMOC maximum. (c) Stadial anomalies of surface air temperature (color), Northern Hemisphere sea ice concentration (black contour, upper half of panel; %), and Southern Hemisphere wind stress (N m⁻²).
which of these changes affect CO2. For the present analysis we will focus on the first stadial, and compute the anomalies as the averages of years 4100–4300 minus the averages of years 3500–6500. Other choices can reasonably be made, but will not change the overall conclusions. The main focus is on the air–sea fluxes; the impact of an AMOC collapse on the terrestrial carbon pools has been discussed already by Nielsen et al. (2019) for a preindustrial setup of the present model version: a shift of the ITCZ during stadials leads to drying of tropical rain forests and carbon release (Fig. 3a).

There are various factors that affect the air–sea fluxes of carbon: sea surface temperature and salinity, through solubility; sea ice concentration, by isolating areas of CO2 uptake or outgassing from the atmosphere; and wind speed, by influencing the rate of air–sea gas exchange. Then there are indirect effects like wind stress curl, by determining up- and downwelling of nutrients, and CO2 removal by plankton through photosynthesis and subsequent dying and sinking to the abyssal oceans [the list above is not exhaustive; see Williams and Follows (2011) for a review]. Inspection of the stadial carbon flux anomalies show that the largest changes are indeed associated with North Atlantic (NA) and North Pacific (NP) cooling and associated changes in sea ice cover (cf. Figs. 2c and 3a).

**Fig. 3.** (a) Stadial anomalies of air–sea/land flux of carbon (color) and tropical precipitation (red; mm day\(^{-1}\)), as well as the line of zero wind stress curl in the SO (green), which separates upwelling and downwelling regions. Negative carbon-flux anomalies indicate areas that contribute to a reduction in CO2, which can be the result of reduced outgassing (e.g., tropical east Pacific) or increased uptake (e.g., subtropical North Atlantic). (b) Zonal integral of stadial rate anomalies. (c) Stadial anomalies of NA (black), NP (blue) CO2, and NA export production across 700 m (green). Here, export production is converted to the equivalent rate of atmospheric CO2 change, so lower export production will result in a positive sign. (d) Stadial anomalies of export production across 700 m (\(\mu\)mol C m\(^{-2}\) s\(^{-1}\)).
b. Grouping by climate regime

The stadial flux anomalies are quite patchy, but one can meaningfully group them together into the NA or NP (both north of 30°N), the tropics (30°S–30°N), and the Southern Ocean (SO; south of 30°S), each one of which has its own particular response to the stadial onset. The flux anomalies are integrated over the respective areas and converted to rates of ppm CO₂ change per century (1 ppm CO₂ is equivalent to 2.12 PgC). This makes it easier to put the results into the context of the observed stadial CO₂ increase of 0.6 ± 0.25 ppm per century. Interestingly, the NA and NP have compensating responses to the AMOC collapse (Fig. 3b): the direct cooling leads to increased solubility in the NP, and increased uptake of carbon (Fig. 3a). While some of this is at play in the NA as well, this is more than compensated by the barrier effect of more sea ice (cf. the sea ice changes in the NP and NA) and the collapse of marine productivity (Fig. 3c).

As seen in other studies as well, this reduced efficiency of the biological pump is due to the AMOC collapse. In particular in the NA the stadial mixed layer stays shallow due to the absence of deep convection, and nutrients are trapped below the euphotic zone (e.g., Schmittner 2005). Because the present CESM version does not carry isotopes like ¹³C, it is not possible to quantify exactly how much this reduced biological productivity contributes to the total change in NA air–sea fluxes [see Khatiwala et al. (2019) or Gu et al. (2020) for challenges and solutions to quantify the strength of the biological pump, and Shao et al. (2021) for the interpretation of ¹³C records]. However, computing the rate anomaly of particulate organic carbon (a proxy for the strength of the biological pump) below the realm of the wind-driven circulation at 700 m suggests that much of the NA CO₂-rate anomaly may indeed be due to lower export production (Fig. 3b).

In the SO four processes modulate the air–sea fluxes of carbon: export production, midlatitude subduction (north of the zero-curl line in Fig. 3a) and upwelling (south of it), and polar deep convection (Gruber et al. 2009). Here, because of the extensive glacial sea ice cover, there is little uptake of carbon off the Antarctic coast (not shown), and hence only a negligible stadial anomaly. There are, however, changes to air–sea fluxes and the export production (Fig. 3c) between 60° and 40°S, and they are correlated with a smaller than 5% reduction in wind stress (Fig. 2c), the SO mean wind stress is on the order of 0.1–0.2 N m⁻². For the most part the flux anomalies are of opposite sign and lie on opposite sides of the zero-line of the mean wind stress curl (Fig. 2d), which results in a small net contribution to CO₂ (Fig. 3b). The SO CO₂ rate anomaly does, with a lag, track the SO SST anomaly (Fig. 3c), which in turn looks similar to the Antarctic temperature anomaly (Figs. 2a, 3c). As shown by Pedro et al. (2018), the stadial warming of the SO and Antarctica happens on the slow ocean time scale as seen here as well. The atmosphere, however, responds rapidly to the ITCZ shift induced by the AMOC collapse [see also Chiang and Bitz (2005) and Markle et al. (2017)]. This suggests that the immediate SO carbon release at the onset of the stadial is caused by the rapid changes to the southerly winds, whereas the later increase is caused by the slow warming of the SO. In the tropics the stadial reorganization and general weakening of the hydrological cycle (Fig. 3a) lead to reduced upwelling and outgassing in all three basins. Locally these changes are only of small amplitude (less than 5%) but add up to a sizable net contribution, opposing the SO contribution (Fig. 4a).

The analysis so far suggests that there are four ocean regions that have a stadial CO₂ rate response of similar magnitude. We propose to reduce the complexity of the problem by combining these four into two: an AMOC-forced NH response (North Atlantic and Pacific, because they show similar temperature and sea ice patterns; Fig. 2c) and a remotely wind-forced response (SO and tropics). This is not only physically meaningful, but also increases the robustness of the results because it combines different offsetting responses and uncertainties: solubility versus sea ice and export production in the former regions, and upwelling and downwelling in the latter. Furthermore, most of the water that upwells in the tropics originates in the southern midlatitudes (Pedlosky 1987) so that reduced uptake of carbon in the SO will lead to reduced outgassing in the tropics even without changes to the winds there.

Thus, we propose to explain the evolution of CO₂ as the sum of three processes, all ultimately triggered by a collapse of the AMOC. First, cooling and shifting precipitation leads to reduced terrestrial productivity and carbon loss, mainly in Africa (Fig. 3a; green line in Fig. 4b). This terrestrial carbon loss is compensated by reduced outgassing of the remote wind-forced response (the net result of reduced SO uptake and reduced tropical outgassing: red line in Fig. 4b). Changes in the NP and NA largely compensate each other so that throughout the stadials the northern mid- to high-latitude oceans play a minor role for CO₂. Second, as the SO SST continues to rise, the SO becomes an ever larger source of CO₂ (Fig. 4a), which explains the approximately 200-yr delay in the onset of the CO₂ rise during the stadial. Third, while during the stadial the northern mid- and high-latitude ocean acts as a sink of carbon, the strong rebound of NH temperature at the onset of the interstadial leads to reversal (Fig. 3b), so that the North Atlantic and Pacific, like the tropics (Fig. 4a), lead to the CO₂ rise in the first several centuries of the interstadial (black line in Fig. 4b).

It should be kept in mind that Fig. 4b illustrates the integrated anomalies with respect to year 4000, after the onset of the first stadial. Thus, the accumulated anomalies of the second stadial contain not only the results of the processes discussed above, but also long-term trends, and the effects of differences between the first and the second stadial. Two realizations provide not enough data to determine how large the variance of the stadial flux anomalies is, but Figs. 3b and 4a suggest the following: the North Atlantic and Pacific anomalies are fairly similar between the two stadials, whereas SO seems to exhibit a long-term trend, and the tropics show large interstadial variability (e.g., the red line at year 4800 in Fig. 4a). While these differences between model stadial 1 and 2 are noticeable, they are not so large to suggest that carbon flux balances are fundamentally different between different stadials. Instead, the CO₂ anomalies in Fig. 2a suggest that while there may be regional differences between various stadials they are mostly compensating.

c. Additional effects in HOSE and IRON

The multitude of similarly important but opposing regions and processes makes one wonder about the robustness of the results,
especially since the total simulated CO$_2$ variability of 3–4 ppm is at the low end of the observed range. Since the stadial rate of CO$_2$ increase appears to be rather constant across the various stadials (Zheng et al. 2021), we decided to prolong the simulated first GLA stadial with an 800-yr freshwater pulse (called HOSE; Fig. 4c). As in the observations, here, too, the rate of stadial CO$_2$ increase remains the same (Fig. 5a), and the total CO$_2$ increase is simply determined by the length of the stadials.
Note that in contrast to standard hosing experiments where the AMOC is reduced with hosing, Greenland does not cool further here because the AMOC is already switched off. This is an indication that, at least in the model, Heinrich stadials are not fundamentally different from regular stadials; they are just longer. Similarly, a look at the CO₂ rate anomalies shows that initially the stadial anomalies are similar in GLA and HOSE, but that as the stadial wears on, the terrestrial vegetation and the upper ocean (the tropics, SO, and terrestrial) slowly come into equilibrium with respect to their carbon content [as already suggested by Siegenthaler and Wenk (1984) and Sarmiento and Toggweiler (1984)], and the CO₂ is controlled by the continued reduced carbon uptake of the North Atlantic (Fig. 5b, black curve).

Last, reducing the dust fluxes in HOSE by 50% (simulation IRON) further increases the CO₂ signal (Fig. 5a), mostly due to a reduced productivity and carbon uptake in the SO (Figs. 5c,d), in line with the conclusions of Martínez-García et al. (2014). However, the impact of this reduced uptake weakens over time, just as the other upper ocean processes in HOSE (not shown, but evidenced by the flattening of the IRON CO₂ curve in Fig. 5a).

4. Discussion

We quantified the impact of stadials on CO₂ fluxes, and the impact of changed freshwater and iron fluxes during stadials.
Of these analyses we consider the latter as the least robust; it is more a starting point for a more detailed study. During the LGM dust fluxes are considered to be several times higher than today (Rea 1994), whereas GLA uses present-day fluxes, which may lead to different sensitivities. Furthermore, in IRON dust fluxes were reduced globally, whereas the structure of the bipolar seesaw leads to an increase in the Northern Hemisphere, or at least over Greenland (NGRIP members 2004). Thus, any SO dust-flux induced CO2 signal may be compensated by increased productivity in the North Pacific low-iron regions—although there is no observational evidence for this (Burgay et al. 2021). Of course, apart from the experimental design, modeling the iron cycle is bedeviled by its particular complexity, which can lead to vastly different outcomes for similar experiments [see Gottschalk et al. (2019) for a summary].

There are numerous previous numerical studies that try to quantify the impact of an AMOC collapse on CO2, mostly done with models of intermediate complexity. Unfortunately, even the simulations with glacial boundary conditions do not even agree on the sign of the response, that is, if ocean and land are net sources or sinks of carbon following AMOC collapse [compare Schmittner and Galbraith (2008), Bouttes et al. (2012), and Menviel et al. (2008)]. These differences can be attributed to the effects of, first, freshwater hosing on stratification and therefore on air–sea carbon fluxes, and, second, insufficiently realistic representation of the models’ atmosphere (Gottschalk et al. 2019). A detailed comparison of each of these models with CESM1 is beyond the scope of the present study, but it should be pointed out that what these models lack in realism, they compensate for in cost. Thus, if they are deemed realistic they can be used to identify sensitive model parameters (i.e., Menviel et al. 2014) and then test how robust the results are. It appears that Menviel et al. (2008) describe one such model: it has a similar carbon flux response during stadials as CESM1 (possibly because it has a dynamic atmosphere that allows for a shift of the ITCZ), but is inexpensive enough to allow for numerous sensitivity studies.

There are three ESM studies that we are aware of in which the carbon flux response to an AMOC collapse is quantified (Obata 2007; Bozbiyik et al. 2011; Nielsen et al. 2019). All three have comparable resolutions to the present CESM1, but all induce the AMOC collapse during a preindustrial climate, and the duration of their AMOC collapse is different in each. It is reassuring, though, that in each three of them, as in CESM1, the AMOC collapse is followed by terrestrial carbon release, increase of CO2, and ocean uptake of carbon. With the exception of Nielsen et al. (2019) (whose model physics and biogeochemistry modules are identical to CESM1’s) the spatial pattern of these changes differs from CESM1 and from each other, but all show the North Atlantic basin as the ocean basin that has the largest absolute and relative flux changes.

Fortunately, there are observational constraints for some of the presented regional stadial/interstadial differences. A weakened or collapsed AMOC during stadials was found to be linked with increased NA sea ice and reduced export production (e.g., Henry et al. 2016; Sadatzki et al. 2019; Rasmussen et al. 2003) and North Atlantic carbon release (Ezat et al. 2017). Outside the North Atlantic comparisons between model results and proxy data are complicated by the fact at least the present model shows rather patchy differences between stadials and interstadials (e.g., Fig. 3c). Thus, the few available cores of sufficient resolution are not necessarily representative for a basin. The North Pacific is a case in point: whereas Kiefer et al. (2001) suggest for millennial time scale an antiphase relation between NA and NP SST, Prætorius and Mix (2014), Schlünder et al. (2013), and Riethdorf et al. (2013) find an in-phase relation (the former two only for the deglaciation), whereas Kiefer and Kienast (2005) find mixed signals. More recently, Waleczak et al. (2020) even suggested that NP ice sheet discharge is preceding Heinrich events.

For the Southern Ocean Jaccard et al. (2016) and Gottschalk et al. (2016) find that stadials are associated with increased Antarctic Bottom Water (AABW) production and ventilation in the Atlantic sector of the SO, as well as reduced biological export of carbon, which at least for Heinrich stadial 1 is associated with an increased partial pressure of CO2 and presumably outgassing (Martínez-Botí et al. 2015; Shuttleworth et al. 2021). The former two occur here as well [not shown, but see Vettoretti et al. (2022) for the AABW responses in the present model]. As for the latter, Fig. 3c shows the stadial signal of particulate organic carbon export at 700 m depth in GLA. The model does not agree with the observed decrease at the two Atlantic sector sites at 40°S. However, reducing the aeolian iron deposition in IRON does lead to a strongly reduced carbon uptake (Fig. 5c) in the part of the South Atlantic that is fertilized by Patagonian dust. Thus, while the total contribution of dust-deposition variations is uncertain, they have the potential to explain regional variations in air–sea fluxes of carbon.

The most powerful constraint for the sources of stadial CO2 increase probably comes from Bauska et al. (2018): They analyze the isotopic signature of the stadial CO2 increases and find that it must be dominated by changes to the biosphere with both terrestrial as well as marine biology contributing. The present model does not account for isotopic compositions of carbon, but the terrestrial and marine organic carbon fluxes are computed and saved during the integration. Terrestrial release of carbon does indeed make a major contribution (Fig. 4b, as a response to the southward shift of the ITCZ; see above). The importance of changes to the marine biology are less clear. Air–sea carbon fluxes shown in Fig. 3a are the result of physical and biological processes, yet the organic carbon is partly remineralized and returned to the surface by turbulence and advection (Fig. 3c). The deviation of in situ oxygen from oxygen concentrations can be used to infer the contribution of biological processes to the ocean carbon inventory (e.g., Williams and Follows 2011). However, given uncertainties with regards to preformed oxygen levels (i.e., disequilibrium oxygen), in particular in regions of large sea ice cover, this approach is likely flawed (Khatiwala et al. 2019). In lieu of a better way, we show in Fig. 3c the stadial anomaly of export production (converted to rate of CO2 change) below 700-m depth, which is below the subtropical overturning cells that would return the carbon to the surface in less than a century. Thus, while we cannot show unequivocally that the present results are consistent with Bauska et al. (2018), we find that reduced terrestrial and North Atlantic marine
biological productivity are indeed major contributors to stadial increase in atmospheric CO2.

The individual processes described here are not well constrained by observations, and our confidence rests mainly on the realistic simulation of the ice-core temperature and carbon records, which represent the cumulative effect of several processes. Since we observe large compensating effects, small changes to individual processes may have an outsized impact on CO2. Thus, a crucial next step is a model ensemble with modified ocean mixing parameters, typically the most uncertain aspect of ocean models (e.g., Eden et al. 2009). A separate interesting line of enquiry focuses on the system’s sensitivity to changes in the deposition of dust. ESMs now provide enough granularity that direct comparisons between simulated and observed sedimentation rates can be made, and a simulated connection between dust deposition rates and export production can be tested, which will be the subject of our future work.

5. Summary

We have described the response of carbon fluxes in CESM to centennial-scale climate oscillations. In contrast to previous studies the oscillations were not forced through hosing, and the model physics and biogeochemistry are identical to the ones used for climate projections. The model reproduces the amplitude and relative timing of the observed Greenland and Antarctic temperature fluctuations, as well as the amplitude and relative timing of the CO2 fluctuations. The fact that the temperature and CO2 expressions of the oscillations are similar to the observations lends confidence also to the climate–carbon cycle interactions projected with this model into the future (e.g., Long et al. 2013).

We find that the CO2 response to stadials consists of three stages: First, during the first centuries of stadials, anomalies in tropical land, the North Atlantic and Southern Ocean act to increase atmospheric CO2, whereas the tropics and the North Pacific act to reduce it.

Second, 500 years after the onset of a stadial, the upper ocean and the terrestrial biosphere have reached a new equilibrium and only the reduced export production in the North Atlantic contributes to a further increase in CO2.

Third, after the onset of an interstadial all ocean basins except for the North Atlantic release the CO2 absorbed during the stadials, which explains the fact that CO2 rises for the first several hundred years of interstadials.

One can condense this even further: a cooler and drier terrestrial vegetation during stadials loses carbon, and much of it is absorbed by the ocean. This carbon is then released during the early interstadial and returned to the land.

As discussed above, it has been shown before that the North Atlantic and terrestrial vegetation make a contribution to stadial CO2 rise. What our simulations allowed us to do is to quantify their respective importance and relative timing. The simulations also provided a novel possible interpretation for the observed correlation between CO2 and Antarctic temperature: rather than both being controlled by Southern Ocean processes, they are both controlled by the AMOC and much of the stadial extra CO2 may not be of Southern Hemisphere origin. However, the simulations also suggest that the sensitivity of the Southern Ocean to iron fertilization may turn the global ocean from a stadial carbon sink to a carbon source.

The present findings may not be applicable for stadials longer than several centuries. This is not just because stadials of this length are not analyzed here, but also because carbon pools that we have categorized as inert (e.g., permafrost, ocean sediments) may well become active players on longer time scales. In this context it is worthwhile pointing out that in both HOSE and IRON the CO2 increase tapers off before the end of the stadial (Fig. 5a). This suggests that it takes processes not represented in CESM1 to reproduce the CO2 response of millennia-scale stadials. Finally, it is worth repeating that the quantification of the carbon pools in section 2 reveals that the GLA ocean does not contain enough carbon. Shortcomings in any or all of the various carbon pumps could be responsible (e.g., Eggleston and Galbraith 2018), but previous CESM1 literature (e.g., Long et al. 2013) and inspection of the present results suggests that the poor ventilation of the abyssal Pacific Ocean in CESM1 is a likely culprit.

Acknowledgments. We are grateful to Matthew Long and David Lawrence for their patience in explaining the details of the CESM biogeochemistry. The manuscript was improved greatly by the suggestions of one anonymous referee, Julia Gottschalk, Thomas Bauska, and the editor Shawn Marshall. The computations were done at the Danish Center of Climate Computing at the Niels Bohr Institute, Copenhagen. MJ and RN were supported by Copenhagen University, SOR by the VILLUM Foundation through IceFlow, JP received support from the Australian Government Department of Industry, Science, Energy and Resources (Grant ASC1000002). GV by the Australian Research Council’s Discovery Projects funding scheme (project DP180102357).

Data availability statement. Model results are available here: https://std.ersa.dk/wsgi-bin/fs.py?share_id=BokDarcci8.

REFERENCES


Rasmussen, T. L., and Coauthors, 2003: Millennial-scale glacial variability versus Holocene stability: Changes in planktic and benthic foraminifera faunas and ocean circulation in the North


Shao, J., L. D. Stott, L. Menviel, A. Ridgwell, M. Ødalen, and M. Mohtadi, 2021: The atmospheric bridge communicated the δ13C decline during the last deglaciation to the global upper ocean. ClimatePast, 17, 1507–1521, https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-17-1507-2021.


