



'Seeing' and 'Being Seen': An Embodied and Culturally Sensitive Arts-Integrated Pedagogy Creating Enriched Conditions for Learning in Multi-Cultural Schools

Nielsen, Charlotte Svendler; Samuel, Gerard M.; Wilson, Lisa; Vedel, Karen A.

Published in:

International Journal of Education and the Arts

DOI:

[10.26209/ijea21n2](https://doi.org/10.26209/ijea21n2)

Publication date:

2020

Document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Document license:

[CC BY-NC](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/)

Citation for published version (APA):

Nielsen, C. S., Samuel, G. M., Wilson, L., & Vedel, K. A. (2020). 'Seeing' and 'Being Seen': An Embodied and Culturally Sensitive Arts-Integrated Pedagogy Creating Enriched Conditions for Learning in Multi-Cultural Schools. *International Journal of Education and the Arts*, 21(2), 1-24. <https://doi.org/10.26209/ijea21n2>

International Journal of Education & the Arts

Editors

Christopher M. Schulte
University of Arkansas

Kristine Sunday
Old Dominion University

Peter Webster
University of Southern California

Eeva Anttila
University of the Arts Helsinki

Mei-Chun Lin
National University of Tainan

<http://www.ijea.org/>

ISSN: 1529-8094

Volume 21 Number 2

January 20, 2020

‘Seeing’ and ‘Being Seen’: An Embodied and Culturally Sensitive Arts-Integrated Pedagogy Creating Enriched Conditions for Learning in Multi-Cultural Schools

Charlotte Svendler Nielsen
University of Copenhagen, Denmark

Gerard M. Samuel
University of Cape Town, South Africa

Lisa Wilson
University of Cape Town, South Africa

Karen A. Vedel
University of Copenhagen, Denmark

Citation: Svendler Nielsen, C, Samuel, G.M., Wilson, L., & Vedel. K.A. (2020). ‘Seeing’ and ‘being seen’: An embodied and culturally sensitive arts-integrated pedagogy creating enriched conditions for learning in multi-cultural schools. *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 21(2). Retrieved from <http://doi.org/10.26209/ijea21n2>.

Abstract

This article explores the pedagogy developed for enriching conditions for learning among 10-11 year-old children in culturally diverse schools in Cape Town and Copenhagen in an artistic-educational project led by an intercultural group of artist-educators, teachers and researchers from Denmark and South Africa. The group created a workshop format in the cross-over between dance and visual arts focused on the theme of climate change, the elements of nature (water, air, earth and fire) and their importance in the southern and the northern hemispheres. Based on a hermeneutic phenomenological analysis (van Manen, 1990) that connects the children's experiences and the artist-educators' experiences of how learning became possible in different ways, it is argued that enriched conditions for learning can be fostered through integrating art forms (here dance and visual arts) and by tools that constitute an embodied and culturally sensitive pedagogy.

Introduction

When talking to Onako and two other girls from a primary school in Cape Town about their experiences in a dance and visual arts-integrated project that we, a group of artist-educators and researchers¹ from Denmark and South Africa, carried out with their class, she suddenly looks at me with wonder and asks: "Is Denmark close to Mars?"

(Charlotte Svendler Nielsen, co-researcher)

Copenhagen and Cape Town are situated 10,000 kilometres from each other on an almost direct line between north and south, or south and north depending on one's perspective. In 2017 and in both these cities, a group of approximately twenty 10-11 year-old children were part of a week-long arts education workshop relating to the theme of climate change, the elements of nature (water, air, earth and fire) and their importance in the southern and the northern hemispheres. Artistically named Red Apples – Green Apples², the project was driven

1. The term 'artist-educator' is used here aptly and encapsulates the multiple identities of the various team members of the project. Many of the team's educators are also creative and performing artists: Freelance dance artist and landscape architect Peter Vadim (Denmark), dance artists Anu Rajala-Erkut (Finland/Denmark), Jamie-Lee Jansen and Erica Maré (South Africa). Fabian Hartzenberg (South Africa) is design specialist and arts educator at the Peter Clarke Art Centre (PCAC), and Liesl Hartman (South Africa) is visual artist, educator and at the time of the project Principal of PCAC.

2. Red Apples – Green Apples was formally a part of the Knowledge Production, Archives and Artistic Research network project, led by the University of Copenhagen and supported by the Danish Agency for Science, Technology and Innovation's International Network Program, and The Danish Cultural Institute in 2016 & 2017.

by an intercultural group of artists-educators and researchers from Denmark and South Africa focused on generating teaching material in the cross-over between dance and visual arts as an integrated arts pedagogy. Onako's question underlines an important aspect of this project as we continuously questioned the relevance of the project to the children - both its contents and its pedagogical approaches.

Many children around the world do not learn as much as would be desirable in school as is evident in international studies like PIRLS and PISA³, but learning is not just outcomes that can be measured in such comparable tests. Learning is also cultural, social, embodied and aesthetic processes (Svendler Nielsen, 2015) and those dimensions can be both the means and the goal of teaching. When they are means to learning different subject matter, they serve as fundamental conditions for this learning to happen (Illeris, 2009). The focus of this article is thus to explore *how an arts-integrated pedagogy can contribute to creating enriched conditions for learning in multicultural schools*.

Review of Literature Concerning the Potentials of Arts Education in the Classroom

Pierre du Plessis et.al (2007) posit the classroom as a place where cultural transmission takes place granting the educator an important role in bridging cultural differences that may exist between the learners, the teacher's pedagogical style, the curriculum and school culture, and which can cause learners to experience cultural isolation, cultural erosion, conflict, and communication challenges. Research has shown that serious alienation and cultural discontinuity experienced by learners can lead to failing in school (Rhodes et.al, 2005). Hence educators (e.g. Gay, 2002; Richards, Brown & Forde, 2007) have developed ideas of 'culturally responsive pedagogy'. Such pedagogy acknowledges that children bring a variety of languages, cultural traditions and practices to the classroom that teachers can utilise in the learning experience so that it becomes more meaningful, interesting, appealing, thorough, and accessible (Gay, 2002). In the new democratic South Africa with its educational policy framework of inclusion and redress, teaching and learning that honours the diverse cultural heritage of the learners and validates the worth of not least the historically marginalised is imperative. A focus on inclusion is also evident in the current Danish school system, only here it relates to those formerly categorised as 'special-needs children'.

The South African partners are the University of Cape Town's Centre for Theatre, Dance and Performance Studies and the Peter Clarke Arts Centre (PCAC).

³The Progress in International Reading Literacy Study (PIRLS) is an international assessment that monitors trends in fourth grade students' achievement in reading <https://timssandpirls.bc.edu/pirls2016/>. The OECD's Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) tests 15-year-old students from all over the world in reading, mathematics and science <http://www.oecd.org/pisa/>

With classrooms becoming increasingly diverse teachers are challenged to expand their traditional pedagogies to be more sensitive to the diverse needs and cultural backgrounds of the learners (Richards, Brown & Forde, 2007). Research in the area of learning conditions are generally not looking at arts education even though the arts have long been considered teaching and learning spaces through which knowledge can be created, connected, explored, reflected upon, and even re-imagined (Eisner, 2002; 2004). The arts are also languages of communication that can 'translate' between cultures, diverse learners and disciplines, and that can be used pedagogically to give learners multiple entry points into a particular content, as well as deepen learning connections across the curriculum (Koff, 2000).

Experiences in the past influence who we are and when we create ourselves anew (when engaging in educational processes for example) we make new interpretations of who we were, who we are and who we wish to become. Arts education is crucial in exactly this endeavour (Wright, 2010). In the area of visual arts Susan Wright (2010) has developed ideas of an embodied visual arts education that promotes creative processes in early childhood. In this project we develop an embodied pedagogy that integrates visual arts and dance in the contexts of multi-cultural primary school classrooms. We explore how a pedagogy of the arts that enhances the opportunities for learners to express, explore and possibly negotiate their identities in the classroom can be a way to support them to gain more knowledge and access into their own embodied experiences, the experiences of others, the curriculum and the larger world.

Learning as Embodied Knowing, Being and Understanding

"Where do you come from?" A boy asked as I peered around the corner of what is his classroom in September 2017. My unannounced entry into his classroom in this school in Copenhagen seemed to peak his curiosity and provide an easy opportunity for this apparently confident boy to speak to me in English. The dance between us: local and foreigner, pre-pubescent boy and adult male as well as a certain cultural framing and scaffolding, had begun. I had anticipated that the project, would take a particular twist from my perspective as a mono-lingual teacher. However, the whole question of a linguistic modality in a Dance classroom is significant when such 'language teaching' can be interpreted as a heightened embodied encounter with the other. In other words, the transmission of knowledge and any shaping of a particular experience that is being designed are learnt through and with a body.

(Gerard M. Samuel, artist-educator and co-researcher)

In order to be able to give accounts of learning and to reflect on how learning might be facilitated, the starting point for us is a theoretical understanding of learning that is grounded in the body and its multiple dimensions, that is the physical, the cultural, the social, the sensuous, the emotional and the expressive (Svendler Nielsen, 2009, 2015). We can say that we have learned “when we have understood a new idea, developed a new skill or become more aware of something than we were before” (Danuser & Sabetti, 2001, p. 79). As noted by Danuser and Sabetti (2001, p. 77), the more the senses are simultaneously involved in a learning process, the more engaging the experience. Drawing on the ideas of Danuser and Sabetti (2001) we focus on being aware of situations in which the learners seem to be touched at a more fundamental (embodied) level, as such situations would be examples of when learning is integrated more completely with who they are as persons. Consequentially, the comprehension and experience of meaning will also be deeper and longer lasting.

Points of Entry into Understanding the Value of an Arts-Integrated Teaching and Learning Environment

Central in our endeavour to foster learning about climatic and cultural issues was an understanding of the body as lived and that “practicing the arts is a form of thinking and being aware that is deeply rooted in the body” (Wright, 2010, p.81). But the phenomenon of embodied learning is hard to capture (what exactly has been learned, by whom and when), instead we turn to describing the pedagogical approaches and how *conditions* for learning seemed to be enriched by these approaches. Conditions for learning are observed as those processes that seem to increase the children’s opportunities to achieve, engage, actively participate in, and make meaningful sense of the activities. From a phenomenological perspective we acknowledge that these are processes that happen in dialogue between pre-reflective and reflective levels of consciousness (Danuser & Sabetti, 2001). The two groups of learners in the project were school classes that may be termed multi-cultural with reference to the diverse cultural backgrounds of the children. When we strive for offering engaging experiences in classes that are multi-cultural in nature, it becomes of specific importance to consider the cultural dimension of the children’s diverse, embodied and lived experiences as meaning is culturally formed and embedded (Danesi, 2007).

Who Are the Children?

The group of children in Cape Town who, on a daily basis during the project week were transported by bus from their school in the suburb of Athlone to the Peter Clarke Arts Centre, consisted of children from different social as well as cultural and religious backgrounds. The majority speak English at school and isiXhosa or Afrikaans at home. The group of children taught in the environment of their own school in Copenhagen, was equally diverse considering their social, cultural, religious and language backgrounds. The majority (18 out of

22) are immigrants originating from 12 different countries, mainly in the Middle East. Even though there were children in this group less fortunate in socio-economic terms, the level of poverty is much lower than in Cape Town. In Copenhagen, the children are fed the meals they need every day, but as some families rarely can afford to buy new clothes, their child will wear the same clothes every day for a week. In Cape Town, the children wear school uniforms, but the differences in their socio-economic status are still apparent: some girls wear boys' uniforms or very worn out uniforms revealing that they are being passed down between siblings. Another major difference between the living circumstances of the two groups is the issue of safety. The school in Cape Town is located next to an area known for its high levels of crime, also against children. The school is surrounded by barbed wire and has strong procedures of who can and cannot enter, whereas one can freely walk in to and out of the school in Copenhagen without anyone taking notice.

Ethical Considerations

The children were informed about the purpose of the project initially by their teachers and by us once we started the weekly projects at the schools, but it was the teachers' decisions to become involved in the projects, so the children did not have a choice of not participating. However, we said to them that they could tell us if they did not want to be part of interviews or be filmed. Moreover, informed consent was obtained from parents/guardians through a letter informing them about the purpose of the project, how it would be carried out, their right to get insight to material involving their own child, and to withdraw their consent at any moment until publication of articles about the project. In the writing phase of the research we have pondered a lot about whether to use children's real names or not as we feel it might actually be more ethical to use the children's real first names (but not surnames) instead of giving them invented names for publications when we do not know if there might be another child of the same age at the school with the name that we might have chosen to use. We do not see it as a risk in any way that they themselves, the teachers and parents who would perhaps read the articles might recognise them if we are mindful about not sharing material which is of a vulnerable character in ways that can reveal who is involved. It might be more problematic that they can be in doubt as to who is who. Based on these considerations we have chosen to use the children's real first names, but to not mention names if we are sharing material which is about vulnerable issues. For such material we only mention the gender of the child.

The Red Apples – Green Apples Project

In the two project weeks a wide variety of dance and visual arts activities and approaches were used to explore each of the four elements of nature. Overall the pedagogy encompassed presenting the learners with using various modalities in their learning experiences and

providing opportunities for recurrent reflexivity throughout the process. Every day, the learners were encouraged to reflect in group discussions as well as in drawings. These reflections allowed both learners and artist-educators to make personal sense of the teaching and learning experiences respectively and to discover its value and meaning for their lives.

From a research perspective during the project weeks we explored how dance and visual arts could be integrated in educational activities and how we could elicit knowledge about the children's experiences of these activities. In order to create a visible relation between their embodied experiences and their articulation of these experiences, we gave them different verbal and non-verbal/arts-based tasks based on ideas of multi-modality emphasising how sensations in one mode can be evoked by sensations in a different mode (Danesi, 2007). Central to the methodology is also the use of concrete descriptions of the children's experiences in the form of extracts from interviews and as "lived-experience descriptions" (van Manen, 1990) of "significant pedagogical moments" written by the artist-educators. Some of these descriptions will subsequently be analysed in order to determine how the situations contribute to creating positive conditions for learning.

A Phenomenological Approach to Elicit Experiences and Expressions

Qualitative research traditionally has focused on verbal expressions and "work conducted within this framework tended to privilege and produce abstract theories and disembodied accounts of the corporeal realities of daily life" (Sparkes, 2017, p. 343). It is, however, important that "(...) sensation is fundamental to our experience of reality (...)" (Bull et al., 2006, p.5 in Sparkes, 2017, p.343). Just as important, however, is the fact that sensing is also a cultural process as what we pay attention to/ are aware of and how we are able to express ourselves about it is based on our experiences. This makes us ponder how we as researchers can create insights of such (embodied) experiences which certainly is a methodological challenge as "normally our bodies are what Leder (1990) calls an absent-presence in our lives (...)" (in Sparkes, 2017, p.345). It is not impossible to create such insight, though, as authors suggest ways to do this using for example long-term ethnographic field studies (Sparkes, 2017), a combination of creative approaches to interviewing and visual methods (Sparkes, 2017, Svendler Nielsen, 2009, 2012) and basing interviews on 'stimulated recall' (Vestereinen, Toom & Patrikainen, 2010). Stimulus for recalling sensations and experiences can for example be photos of situations one was involved in as the watching of photos stimulate a multi-sensuous reflection (Pink, 2011). No matter which of these more alternative approaches is used there is, however, still a translation problem between the different modalities and into a verbal/written form. It is suggested that sensuous experiences and lived meanings can be expressed through attending to "the felt sense" (Gendlin, 1988) and what is felt in so-called "significant moments" (van Manen, 1990, p.163) can be described in words using descriptive language, for example by inspiring to use metaphors which are bodily-anchored images.

Inspired by the outlined approaches we seek to produce knowledge about the children's and the artist-educators' experiences in this intercultural project integrating dance and visual arts.

Reflective Group Dialogues

After some initial attempts to interview the children in a more traditional interview setting we decided to further develop our interview approach with a multi-modal perspective (Svendler Nielsen, 2009) and by organising them as group dialogues that included two-three children and two-three artist-educators/ researchers who all together were involved in a process of reflecting on a number of situations that they recalled as being of significance. The 'stimulated recall' (Vestereinen, Toom and Patrikainen, 2010) was based on photos taken by researchers and artist-educators and drawings made by the children during the lessons. The multi-modal approach entailed using both words, the body/movements and drawings to help the children express themselves about their experiences. "Focusing" (Gendlin, 1988) is a technique to help connect to the 'felt sense' of a situation and describing what this entails gives access to the phenomenological first-person experience of the given situation, this means the experience which one as the actor in the situation has – what appears to be characteristic? What does one emphasise as meaningful and important? This technique was thus used in the reflective group dialogues as a way to create consciousness about embodied experiences in dialogue with language and other forms of expression.

The reflective group dialogues came to have a double function as they gave us more insight to the children's experiences and what was meaningful to them, but they also became a kind of learning dialogues as it became clear to us what did not make sense from the activities and what they did not remember, and so we could elaborate on what was the purpose in the small groups in order to help the children make better sense of what were our intentions.

Embodied and Videographic Participation

Dance researcher Jaana Parviainen (2002) emphasises that one can create knowledge about other people's embodied experience through verbal communication or kinaesthetic empathic understanding. In phenomenologically based research the embodied experiences of the researcher are of great importance for the knowledge that can be created (Depraz et al. 2003). As dancers we have all during many years developed our embodied sensitivity and our own embodied experiences are with us through all phases of the project. For example when we observe the workshops either in the roles as artist-educators and/or as researchers and later when we choose moments that we recall as being special in a pedagogical sense, or choose such moments from our collection of photos and video recordings for deeper analysis.

Photographing and recording of video are methods to catch the bodily actions and expressions in a visual mode. In a phenomenologically inspired videographic research process it is essential that the media both can help as documentation and 'note-taking' and as creating new

insights to and giving room for the participant's first-person perspectives communicating both the verbal and the nonverbal dimensions of their experiences (Svendler Nielsen, 2012). While recalling what happened in the workshops and watching through the audio-visual material we can both see and feel the children's engagement in our own bodies and we use this as an indicator for what moments seem to hold a special intensity in the teaching situations.

Hermeneutic phenomenological analysis

The purpose of phenomenological research is to create more nuanced understandings of how people experience practice, understandings that are created through analyses of the experienced phenomena (van Manen, 1990). To use phenomenology as a methodology to analyse qualitative data entails thick descriptions of how "meanings and sensations" come forth in people's experiences and this can contribute to widen professionals' understandings of what goes on in practice and to widen our theoretical knowledge about those phenomena. But a phenomenological description is according to Dutch educator Max van Manen (1990) in itself not enough to understand 'the action life' of people. Such descriptions need to be interpreted if we also want to understand the unconscious (embodied) dimensions, but bearing in mind that an interpretation is not neutral, it also entails a first-person perspective (that of the researcher).

When taking a hermeneutic phenomenological starting point there is a theoretical background (phenomenological philosophy), but analysis is not conducted from theoretical concepts, the focus instead is on extracting themes and their nuances in order to write forth more detailed understanding of those themes. Only at this point starts a level of interpretation in discussion with theories and other research about the same experienced phenomena (van Manen, 1990). In this article the guiding question leading the hermeneutic phenomenological analyses (van Manen, 1990) of how we can shape embodied and culturally sensitive pedagogies that can enrich learning conditions in multicultural schools is illuminated through the perspectives of both the children and the artist-educators. It is divided into themes found through the analyses (as reflected in the sub-headlines) and includes direct quotes from interviews with children and "lived-experience descriptions" (van Manen, 1990) written by some of the involved professionals who had the dual role as artist-educators and researchers.

Hermeneutic Phenomenological Analysis of 'Moments' in Arts-Integrated Teaching in Multi-Cultural Schools

Silent Teaching: Encountering the Learners Non-Verbally

The class in Copenhagen enters the space to dulcet tones of Debussy's 'Clair de lune'. A calm and mild serenity descends upon us. This follows a period of two days with many verbal instructions and translations which was making me (let alone the children) uncomfortable. As a teacher, I am seeking to discover or question through

dance and movement as my selected pedagogic action/transfer tool. After only two sessions the children were already accustomed to gathering on the floor in a huddle when a lesson was about to commence. I begin with their choice. We soon find ourselves in a wider circle as space was re-negotiated so that everyone could see what their movement leader was doing. I borrowed an old exercise from British educationist, Ed Salt: fingers are (dis)played out in front of our bodies and quickly retracted / hidden behind our backs. We do this a few times to anticipate who will lead the action next. After only a few repetitions the children read this power struggle and with great confidence lead this new and simple game interacting with the group.

No sooner have we done this than a “driving a car’s steering wheel” gesture emerges from one of the children. I noticed and introduce this new gestural phrase. So far no words, no further explanations, no qualifications of how the movement ought to be executed have been relayed by me to the children. Mainly sounds of movement and music that is not too suggestive, but allows the body to find its language fills the space. Not unexpectedly, some rude sounds follow the initial “playing with the car” gesture. Rather than discouraging these, I embrace the fart-like noises and hushed giggles, and amplify these grunts until we are no longer seated but standing at full length. This permits my next creative impulse which is to articulate the extremity of the limbs especially the feet. The latter were jiggled from the ankle. More movement develops and we are able to introduce walking in the play-space, albeit at a gentle pace. Finally, I move the walking in space and stop next to strategically placed cones that have been randomly dotted about the space. A “walk and freeze exercise” ensued that is purposeful, and which asks how and where does the wind stop. It produced answers like “corners” and “but the wind never stops!” “How true”, I thought.

(Gerard M. Samuel, artist-educator and co-researcher)

The nonverbal directions and thus the ‘silent pedagogy’ in use here suggested by shifts in tempo, use of different parts of the body, and different spaces in the room aids in the arrival of what we could term ‘surprise pedagogy’ as the unexpectedness of the situation creates a certain curiosity about what might happen next. This curiosity in turn leads to engagement and focus of the children. The silence of the teacher is what makes this a “significant pedagogical moment” (van Manen, 1990). When no words are used other senses take over and both the children and the teacher become much more focused on ‘seeing’, but not only with their eyes as they must be attentive with all their senses in order to follow each other. Thus, they are trained to be more aware in the situation.

The pedagogic moment described here is arrested when the action or task is freely interpreted and extended by the child. This leads to breaking down in old patterns and hierarchies in the body. It also shows that engaging the children by capturing their attention in different ways makes them open and ready to participate in what follows.

Breaking Down Hierarchies: Taking Turns in Leading and Following

In exploring air on the second day of the workshop in Cape Town the artist-educators posed the question, "How can we move like tissue?" In pairs, one person moves the tissue in the air, creating different patterns and energies while the other partner tries to copy the movements of the tissue in the body. The artist-educators demonstrated the activity, to enhance understanding using the visual sense. The learners grasped the activity well with their partners, whom they also changed during several rounds of the exercise. Learners took turns leading and following. There was laughter, chuckles, broad smiles and active participation by all. With the learners having so much fun we developed the exercise by asking the students to copy the movement as a whole group orchestra with one of the artist-educators in front moving the tissue in interesting ways to broaden the learner's movement exploration. The learners moved their bodies in new ways, with more body parts, different dynamics, and on high, medium and low levels. We then asked if anyone would like to be the conductor of the body orchestra. To my surprise a few of the very quiet, seemingly shy, and distanced girls raised their hands in the air very quickly and volunteered themselves to lead the movement orchestra. For that moment, the timidity they displayed earlier in the week was suspended and a strong sense of belonging to the group was displayed.

(Lisa Wilson, artist-educator and co-researcher)

As the week evolved both learners and artist-educators grew confident in revealing more of themselves in and through the body. Artist-educators increasingly dancing and making art *with* the children broke down some of the hierarchical and power structures of traditional teaching, encouraging and enabling the children to express themselves more freely and engaging in creative processes as the project evolved. The focus on creative processes changes the roles of teachers and children and also fosters change of ways of relating to one another. Change of roles and relationships makes everyone 'see' each other in a different way: when the children engage in different kinds of activities and in different ways than they are used to then they and their class teacher see new sides of their classmates.

When a couple of weeks after the project in Copenhagen one of the boys in an interview was asked if there were any activities in which he had to work with some of those that at the

beginning of the interview he had told us were usually mean to him, and how that was, he responded: “Yes, in the fire dance where we had to shuffle our bodies against each other, in that one I was with Basem and we worked well together. Because I am quite big, so I could help to keep him up and he could show me how to better get down.” When asked if this made a difference to their relationship afterwards, he said: “Yes, Basem and I have become quite good friends, and if we become angry with each other, then we are friends again the day after.” The teacher of these children confirms that she also sees these positive relational changes: “The intensive week we had, I am sure, has had a deep influence on the social relationships in the class. For example among the boys there was a hierarchy, but the fight about being the leader suddenly disappeared.” One of the activities that might have helped these experiences is pictured in the drawing below made by one of the girls in the Copenhagen class as part of the focusing exercise of the reflective group dialogue. In the activity one child had to stand with eyes closed and the others stood around him or her and gently pushed the child around in the circle:



Figure 1. Drawing by a girl in the class in Copenhagen titled “Trusting each other”

The development of social relationships among the children were a big part of their learning experiences as also pictured by this girl from the Cape Town class as part of a reflective group dialogue about special moments in the lessons of the day:



Figure 2. Drawing by a girl in the Cape Town class illustrating an activity including physical contact to a partner and her experience of first feeling scared but after all happy.

Providing Multiple Entries to Experiences: The role of music and rhythm in learning

On the morning of day four, the Danish students requested that we include the rain dance they were taught the previous day in the morning's activities. A few boys were prone to mischief and distractions, often having to be guided to remain on-task. On this morning, the boys were very excited, and it was intriguing to see the change in their way of participating, the increased engagement, focus and confidence. They even counted themselves in without the artist-educator, and were not thrown off even when the artist-educator who was dancing with them made mistakes. "Can we do it again?" says one boy with much influence on the other

boys. Occasionally they would vocalise the lyrics of the song in English, ‘come to the river...’ as they moved.

(Lisa Wilson, artist-educator and co-researcher)



Figure 3. Drawing by a girl in the class in Copenhagen illustrating herself doing the rain dance (by her called “the water dance”).

Why was this rain dance more successful than the fire dance we did earlier in the week? During a reflective group dialogue one of the girls wrote: “We have done the water dance. It was fun because we danced to music which was different and I liked the song and it was a fun experience.” The song was catchy, the beats were clear and easy to follow, and the fact that they started singing themselves indicates that the dance grabbed their attention in multiple ways. This dance was longer than the fire dance, but it was more structured with specific counts and spatial direction in which to perform the phrases. It also was them dancing individually rather than with a partner, which meant fewer negotiations. But at the same time doing the same movements at the same time altogether seemed to also create a certain group feeling. The structure of the rain dance gave the children increased confidence to both accept the challenge of the longer experience as well as have more personal responsibility and control of learning and performing the dance. By giving them this responsibility the artist-educators also express that they ‘see’ them as capable human beings. The role of the music becomes critical to the whole pedagogic experience as mentioned above. What is significant

here is how the gaps between independent learning and social learning can be narrowed as children begin to recognise themselves in the others. They are doing the same thing and thus they see themselves in the others. They are thus both 'seeing' the others and 'being seen' themselves. We are reminded of the cultural difference between us and how in the languaging words themselves can hold affective response⁴. For example, in isiZulu to greet someone with a 'hello' is the utterance 'sawubona' which in its literal translation is 'I see you'. This affirmation feels quite different to a casual 'hi' and underlines the endeavour of the pedagogy we develop in this project.

Consider a similar yet different episode in Cape Town, South Africa:

It was Thursday, day four of the project and Peter Vadim, one of the Danish artist-educators gave the learners a task to go into the garden and gather elements from there (leaves, sticks etc.). The learners were then given two sheets of plastic on which to draw two of the nature objects they had collected. One of the drawings was then first mounted on a window to allow light to pass through it. The other drawing was then mounted on top of the first one, and with the light passing through them one could see both images as a new image. The learners were then asked to creatively connect the two drawings into one final work of art. They were all busy making their drawings in much noise and chatter when suddenly a few learners began to sing in isiXhosa. Soon after most of them, even those who did not know the language, started singing or humming the tune while drawing. The atmosphere of the room changed.

(Lisa Wilson, artist-educator and co-researcher)

What happens in this moment challenges a commonly held pedagogical notion that children need to be quiet and silent to concentrate on their tasks. In contrast the learner initiated singing brought collective calm, increased focus and concentration as they did their drawings and rather than distract them from their work the children were very engaged, motivated and self-directed. One learner said "Singing makes me feel busy and alive", when asked afterwards why did she start singing while she was drawing. The children perhaps felt a sense of cultural belonging and a confident sense of ease to work while singing. Overall we see that the use of different types of music helps creating different atmospheres which engages the students and helps them remember the movements. Music thus serves as a pedagogical tool for providing participation and engagement.

⁴ It is worth noting here that South Africa has 11 official languages

Creating Space for Creativity: Playing with Embodied, Cultural Experiences

A young boy of middle-eastern origin who was often easily distracted by the bigger boys in the group, was more focused than usual in the activity of catching airborne paper rings with different body parts. Standing in the centre in his football apparel from the local Copenhagen club he plays for with his partner throwing rings at him from different directions, he demonstrated highly refined hand/foot-eye coordination and dexterity in catching the rings with his hand, foot and head. The goal of catching as many rings as possible with his body caught his interest and kept him engaged with the task. His small body successfully loaded with paper rings, and his partner having no more rings, without any outside prodding, he added a new challenge to the original task. He started flicking the rings off his own body, mostly his feet, into the air and tried to catch them with his hands, head, and knees. I was very surprised at his speed and agility at the task. His football skills were clearly made visible through this learning task and the broad smile on his face spoke volumes regarding his sense of satisfaction.

(Lisa Wilson, artist-educator and co-researcher)

In tasks with a creative approach there is room for the children's former experiences to flourish as well as for the cultural dimension to be promoted as culture is also evident in the embodied experiences they bring on the floor. In this situation both the class mate and Lisa Wilson as the artist-educator pay special attention to this boy, his skills and experiences and how he likes to be identified (as a football player). They 'see' *him*. From his point of view it is possible that he enjoys 'being seen' as able to use his football skills in this new context and that is identity as a football player hence is confirmed. At the same time the situation might also be special as he experiences a new side of himself as someone who can also dance.

The following describes tasks more focused on the visual expressions in which the children's former experiences were also given room to play with:

Within some of the creative tasks students had latitude to add their own creative interpretations to the structure that was given. For example, in creating plant crowns, they were shown a model but could add their own designs and patterns to make the products their own. In Denmark one could see that some of the migrant learners used motifs from their cultures of origin to decorate their work. They were also provided opportunity to discuss the nature elements each day in Danish and English and to engage in intercultural sharing. For example, artist-educators shared about the differences in seasons in South Africa and Denmark as well as national symbols of the various countries with which the learners culturally

identify. We also showed that cultural differences were valued by displaying the vocabulary of the nature elements of fire, air, water, and earth in multiple home languages for the exhibition space that evolved over the week.

(Lisa Wilson, artist-educator and co-researcher)

The tasks gave the diverse children equal opportunity to shine, to be validated or empowered through being open-ended enough to accommodate their unique and personal ideas, thoughts and responses as well as support the personal expansion of those ideas as in the case of this boy. Our premise for this project was cultural diversity and was not unfounded as we anticipated that children would come from mixed cultural backgrounds, in Cape Town because in the new South Africa (after apartheid) schools have become more culturally integrated and in Copenhagen because the school which was chosen for the project is in an area which demographically consist of people from various cultural backgrounds. In a multi-layered undertaking there is a variety of contributing role-players and factors – in this project these included dance choreographers, art makers of both sexes and gay and straight, and the main teachers of the school children as well as researchers documenting and generating experiences between the many children and adults. There was a difference in how the artist-educators planned their sessions. The moments that have been brought forth as being special in a pedagogical sense in this article are mainly classes that were planned as very loose intentions and that included high awareness of the intentions of the other artist-educators. Those approaches are open enough to also give room for the children's creativity. When considering the success of the rain dance opposed to the fire dance discussed earlier, the unfolding of the children's own ideas which there is room for when the structure is open allows for the children's own contributions and thus they become more engaged. This is probably also part of the answer to the difference of the experiences of the two dances as expressed by one of the girls in a note made during a reflective group dialogue: "It was a water dance. To begin with we were in groups and had to find three things that we do with water and we used this to create the dance."

Emerging Themes Characterising an Embodied and Culturally Sensitive Arts-Integrated Practice - A Pedagogy of 'Seeing' and 'Being Seen'

When we meet other people we first and foremost meet them as physical beings, but the physical dimension is in a phenomenological perspective interconnected with the psychological dimension of living (van Manen, 1990). To create an experience in a space with others always happens as inter-personal processes. Literature in the area of arts education (Eisner, 2002; 2004) reports that the arts are powerful tools for unlocking learning and creating a dynamic and engaging learning experience. But *how* can this happen? What is the

“pedagogical toolkit” developed in this project? How did the project achieve to create enriched conditions for learning?

The descriptions of situations from the Red Apples – Green Apples project above in some way all bring forth that to create enriched conditions for learning through integrated arts education it seems fundamental that there are possibilities to really ‘see’ the children, that they ‘see’ each other and that they feel ‘seen’. Experiences of ‘seeing and being seen’ seem to characterise “significant moments” of this project. We approach the question of ‘seeing’ not merely as linked to sight, but also concerning other senses and the whole body as suggested by van Manen (2002, p.31) when he says that ‘being seen’ to a child or a student means “experiencing being seen by the teacher. It means being confirmed as existing, as being a unique person.”

The four pedagogical themes emerging from the analysis of empirical material collected through reflective group dialogues and embodied and videographic participatory approaches (silent teaching, breaking down hierarchies, providing multiple entries to experiences, creating space for creativity) provide insight into the pedagogical choices that may enrich the children’s learning conditions through integrated dance and visual arts teaching and what a strengthened pedagogical focus on ‘seeing’ the students with ‘more than the eyes’ could mean to their conditions for learning more generally. The four themes all also relate to some more overall phenomena which are also highlighted by other authors to be considered important when striving for engaging children (as well as adults) in pedagogical situations with the purpose of improving their skills, knowledge and awareness of any area.

Atmosphere

The unexpectedness of the situation of ‘silent teaching’ creates a certain curiosity about what might happen next and overall it helps to create an engaging atmosphere. Van Manen (2002, p.54) states that “many teachers intuitively understand that the daily activities of teaching and learning are conditioned by such ineffable factors as the atmosphere of the school and classroom, the relational qualities that pertain amongst students and teachers (...)”. The atmosphere is created by everyone who is in the room, but the teacher has an overall responsibility for the atmosphere and can manipulate this in many ways. Van Manen (2002, p.71) emphasises that: “A teacher has to learn to become sensitive to the ways children experience the complexity of elements that contribute to the atmosphere of the school and classroom”. In artistic-educational activities there might be a special opportunity to work on changing atmospheres in many ways as the processes are more open and with a different purpose than in many other subject areas. The atmosphere can be changed purposefully both by what we are saying or NOT saying and by what we are doing. ‘Silent teaching’ then becomes another option in the toolkit of the art educator.

Empathy

The way a child feels in the class strongly influences the conditions that the child learns within. When the children's relationships are changed to the better it probably therefore also helps their opportunities for learning generally. The change of relationships experienced by the children and observed by their class teachers in this project also had to do with the learner-educator relationships that were developed. From being very quiet and quick at standing in straight lines when they were asked to, the children from the school in Cape Town started to loosen up, dared to ask questions and jumped around and played in the breaks as the days went by during the week we spent with them. This change in their ways of being probably happened because they sensed that this was acceptable in the space we had created together. As we heard from one of the boys from Copenhagen a changed relationship is not just changed in the specific lesson, but sometimes also for the future. Wright (2010, p.2) refers to Vivian L. Gadsden (2008, p. 35) who emphasises the importance for development of empathy that arts education can have as the arts: "allow individuals to place themselves in the skin of another; to experience others' reality and culture; to sit in another space; to transport themselves across time, space, era in history, and context; and to see the world from a different vantage point." We suggest that this empathy has a kinaesthetic dimension especially when the activities centre on movement and embodied approaches to learning [Svendler Nielsen, 2012]. It also seems that it is what happens between all involved at this embodied level of experiencing each other in a new light which makes the difference in the relationships as those experiences are never verbalised or consciously paid attention to in the lessons.

Imagination

The approach to arts education that we practice in this project is one in which the children's imagination and creative processes is at fore. When we work on imagining new or different possibilities of for example ways of making imprints with body parts in a sandpit this might indirectly also help to imagine different possibilities in the bigger picture of the children's lives. So in very concrete ways "art making also allows children to explore abstract and complex concepts, such as what the future may be like" as highlighted by Susan Wright (2010, p.10). Creative activities are pedagogical tools that can challenge the habitual practices of cultural differences in the classroom and promote a rich, engaged and motivating learning environment for all while maintaining learners' cultural identities (van der Merwe, 2013). But the value of arts education is not just to confirm who we already think we are, it is also to have opportunities of trying out and imagining how it might be 'to be' someone else, for example by doing movements and drawing shapes that others invent and to be inspired to use these other ways to extend who we are ourselves a little.

Closing Remarks: Embodied and Culturally Sensitive Pedagogy

The pedagogy that we have developed in the Red Apples- Green Apples project has a strong focus on embodied sensitivity and in that sense it is different to what others have termed ‘culturally responsive pedagogy’ which is grounded in constructivist learning theories (e.g. Gay, 2002; Richards, Brown & Forde, 2007). The essence of an embodied and culturally sensitive pedagogy is to situate learning in both the lived and embodied here-and-now experiences and frames of reference of the children. When there is a focus on engaging the different senses in such processes the subject learning is nurtured more deeply and the experiences become more engaging (Danuser & Sabetti, 2001). As a bi-product, we could say, it seems like the teaching environment that is created through these processes are simultaneously nurturing sensitivity in the relationships among all those involved. This sensitivity creates more openness and acknowledgement of each other among the children which is important for all of them to feel that they belong to the group and are worthy as human beings, something that not all of them might feel considering the poor and harsh conditions some of them live in when they are not at school.

This research with its intercultural and arts-integrated emphasis propose that to create enriched conditions for learning, teaching through the arts we can consider the four pedagogical themes that we have unfolded in this article. A pedagogy that works around those focus points is likely to create enriched conditions for learning with regards to the children understanding more about themselves, others and their surroundings exemplified through the focus on climatic aspects in this project.

Knowledge about the role of embodiment in culturally sensitive teaching could prove to be important for the development of approaches that focus on how children and young people learn to develop their own strategies for living, feeling good and continually being aware of how they feel in a more and more ‘disembodied’ world. Arts-integrated pedagogy that focuses on embodied and culturally sensitive dimensions could for example be considered a useful strategy for fostering the inclusion aim outlined in the educational policy framework of both South Africa and Denmark by giving children multiple inroads into a lesson through for example the kinaesthetic, visual, musical and the verbal-linguistic modalities as exemplified in this article.

Acknowledgements

We owe great thanks to all the children and the school teachers who embarked on this project with us. We also wish to acknowledge the contributions of our colleagues in the project (in alphabetical order): Liesl Hartman, Fabian Hartzenberg, Jamie-Lee Jansen, Erica Maré, Anu Rajala-Erkut and Peter Vadim.

Funding

The Red Apples-Green Applesproject was made possible by funding [grant no. 5132-00138B from the Danish Agency for Science and Higher Education (an International Network Program led by Karen A. Vedel, the Department of Arts and Cultural Studies, University of Copenhagen), the Danish Agency for Culture and Palaces and the Municipality of Copenhagen's Open School funds. The project was also made possible by contributions in the form of in-kind working hours and materials from the Peter Clarke Art Centre in Cape Town and the Universities of Cape Town and Copenhagen.

References

- Danesi, M. (2007). *The quest for meaning: A guide to semiotic theory and practice*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Danuser, E. & Sabetti, S. (2001). Energy pedagogy. In S. Sabetti & L. Freligh (Eds.), *Life energy process* (pp.75-92). München: Life Energy Media.
- Depraz, N., Varela, F. J. & Vermersch, P. (2003). *On becoming aware*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Du Pleissis, P., Conley, C. & du Plessis, E. (2007). *Teaching and learning in South African schools*. Johannesburg: Van Schaik.
- Eisner, E. W. (2002). *The arts and creation of mind*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Eisner, E. W. (2004). What can education learn from the arts about the practice of education? *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 5(4). Retrieved from <http://www.ijea.org/v5n4/>.
- Gay, G. (2002). Preparing for culturally responsive teaching. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 53(2), 106–116.
- Gendlin, E. T. (1988). *Focusing* (2nd ed.). New York: Bantam Doubleday Dell Publishing Group.
- Illeris, K. (Ed.) (2009). *International perspectives on competence development. Developing skills and capabilities*. New York: Routledge.
- Koff, S.R. (2000). Toward a definition of dance education. *Childhood Education*, 77(1), 27-31.
- Parviainen, J. (2002). Kinaesthesia and empathy as a knowing act. In A. M. Fiskvik & E. Bakka (Ed.), *Dance knowledge – dansekunnskap*. Proceedings the 6th NOFOD Conference, Trondheim, Norway (pp.241-247). Trondheim: Norges Teknisk-Naturvidenskabelige Universitet & Rådet for Folkemusikk og Folkedans.

- Pink, S. (2011). A multisensory approach to visual methods. In E. Margolis & L. Pauwels (Eds.), *Sage handbook of visual methods* (pp.601-614). London: Sage.
- Rhodes, R.L., Ochoa, S.H. & Ortiz, S.O. (2005). *Assessing culturally and linguistically diverse students: A practical guide*. London: The Guildford Press.
- Richards, H.V., Brown, A. F. & Forde, T. B. (2007). Addressing diversity in schools: Culturally responsive pedagogy. *Teaching Exceptional Children*, 39(3), 64-68.
- Sparkes, A. (2017). Researching the senses in sport and exercise. In B. Smith & A. Sparkes (Eds.), *Routledge handbook of qualitative research in sport and exercise* (pp. 343-354). New York: Routledge.
- Svendler Nielsen, C. (2009). Children's embodied voices: Approaching children's experiences through multi-modal interviewing. *Phenomenology & Practice*, 3(1), 80-93. Retrieved from <https://journals.library.ualberta.ca/pandpr/index.php/pandpr/article/view/19822>
- Svendler Nielsen, C. (2012). Looking for children's experiences in movement: The role of the body in 'videographic participation'. *FQS Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 13(3), Art. 18. Retrieved from <http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/1571/3448>
- Svendler Nielsen, C. (2015). Exploring learning in dance as artistic-educational practice. In C. Svendler Nielsen & S. Burrige (Eds.), *Dance Education around the World: Perspectives on Dance, Young People and Change* (pp.117-126). New York (NY): Routledge.
- Van Manen, M. (1990). *Researching lived experience. Human science for an action sensitive pedagogy*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Van Manen, M. (2002). *The tone of teaching*. London, Ontario: The Althouse.
- Van der Merwe, M. (2013). Exploring pedagogical choices of preservice teachers for culturally responsive teaching. *Educational Research for Social Change*, 2(2), 59-75.
- Vestereinen, O., Toom, A. & Patrikainen, S. (2010). The stimulated recall method and ICTs in research on the reasoning of teachers. *International Journal of Research and Method*, 33(2), 183-197.
- Wright, S. (2010). *Understanding creativity in early childhood*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.

About the Authors

Charlotte Svendler Nielsen (PhD) is Associate Professor and Head of Studies at the Department of Nutrition, Exercise and Sports, research cluster "Embodiment, Learning and

Social Change” University of Copenhagen, Denmark. She is co-editor of (2015) *Dance Education around the World*, (2017) *Dance, Access and Inclusion*, and (2020) *Dancing across Borders*, all forming part of the book series *Perspectives on Dance, Young People and Change* published by Routledge U.K. She is also Executive Board member of *Dance and the Child International* and Chair of the *European Observatories of Arts and Cultural Education* linked to UNESCO.

Gerard M. Samuel (PhD) is Associate Professor: University of Cape Town School of Dance, Convener: Post Graduate studies in Dance, Editor: *South African Dance Journal*, and Chair of *Confluences* dance conference. During the Apartheid era he performed with the NAPAC Ballet Company and The Playhouse Dance Company in Durban. His research centres on contemporary dance and questions the ontologies of marginalisation and alterity. His notable choreographies include *Prabhati* and *The Man I Love*. Gerard has produced *Place of Grace*, a dance film. He is an advocate of disability arts in South Africa and in Denmark.

Lisa Wilson is Senior Lecturer in the Centre for Theatre, Dance and Performance Studies at the University of Cape Town, South Africa. Her performance credits include Broadway, Atlanta Black Arts Festival, Sydney Olympics, and Jamaica Dance Umbrella. Arts-based research productions include: ‘Meeting Point’ (2018) Little Theatre, Cape Town; ‘Dancing Prism’ (2018) University of Cape Town; ‘Women of Consequence’ (2018) in Adelaide, Australia; and “Same Story” Different Countries (2016-2017) in Delaware, Johannesburg and Cape Town, South Africa. She has published in the *South African Dance Journal*, *Journal of Dance Education*, *Research in Dance Education* and *Dance Current Selected Research*.

Karen Vedel, Associate Professor, PhD, Theatre and Performance Studies, Department of Arts and Cultural Studies, University of Copenhagen. Research areas include dance and theatre historiography, site specificity and cultural memory. Has since 1998 collaborated extensively in projects involving dance artists and scholars in South Africa and the Nordic countries. Selected publications include “Corporeal Aesthetics and the Reception of African American Performing Arts around 1930” as author, in Tania Ørum et al. (eds): *A Cultural History of the Avant-Garde in the Nordic Countries 1925 - 1950*. (Brill, 2019). *Nordic Dance Spaces. Imagining and Practicing a Region*” as chief editor and contributing author (Ashgate, 2014). “Clothing the Suomussalmi Silent People. From Site Specific Performance to Ritually Informed Performative Event” as author, in Christiane Brosius et al. (eds): *Ritual Dynamics and the Science of Ritual. Reflexivity, Media, and Visuality* (Harrassovitz, 2009). For complete list of publications see [https://kunstogkulturvidenskab.ku.dk/ansatte/?pure=da%2Fpersons%2Fkaren-arnfred-vedel\(c1850aa9-95ae-4b6b-a49c-a0bc0e0117ff\)%2Fpublications.html](https://kunstogkulturvidenskab.ku.dk/ansatte/?pure=da%2Fpersons%2Fkaren-arnfred-vedel(c1850aa9-95ae-4b6b-a49c-a0bc0e0117ff)%2Fpublications.html)

International Journal of Education & the Arts

<http://IJEa.org>

ISSN: 1529-8094

Editor

Christopher M. Schulte
University of Arkansas

Co-Editors

Kristine Sunday
Old Dominion University

Mei-Chun Lin
National University of Tainan

Eeva Anttila
University of the Arts Helsinki

Tawnya Smith,
Boston University, U.S.A.

Managing Editors

Christine Liao
University of North Carolina Wilmington

Yenju Lin
Pennsylvania State University

Associate Editors

Shana Cinquemani
Rhode Island School of Design

Heather Kaplan
University of Texas El Paso

Christina Hanawalt
University of Georgia

Shari Savage
Ohio State University

David Johnson
Lund University

Tim Smith
Aalto University

Alexis Kallio
University of the Arts Helsinki

Deborah (Blair) VanderLinde
Oakland University

Advisory Board

Full List: <http://www.ijea.org/editors.html#advisory>